

Critical Review: In individuals with dementia, is hand feeding an effective and feasible alternative to tube feeding?

Natalie Wilkinson

M.Cl.Sc (SLP) Candidate

Western University: School of Communication Sciences and Disorders

8 (&5*9%&)k9:2*%;<k;=;* ? k4;5*)(; ;<k@;49; ;% ; :%&k4'*(:4@*A; ;@&k4' :5* :4* :AA;9)<;* :4@*A; :5&B2; * :2);%4:)<;*)")CB;* A; ;@&k4' * k4* k4@<k@C:25* =k)(* @; ? ;4)k: * = (" " (:<; * A; ;@&k4' * @&AA&9C2)k;57* D4* ;>);45k<;*% ;<k;=*"A*)(;*2k);%)C%;*\$k;2@;@*5k>*%)k92;5*)(:)* = ; ;%9%&k)k9:22\$*% ;<k; = ; @0*5#;9&k&9:22\$*) = " " 4"4E% :4@ " ? &F;@*9" (")%5)C@&k;50*) = " " 5\$5); ? ;)k9*% ;<k;=5* "A*)(;*2k);%)C%;0* :4@*) = " " k4A" " ? :)k"4:2* % ;<k;=5* "A*)(;*2k);%)C%;7* G<;% :220*)(;*% ;5C2)5* = ; ;% k49"492C5k<;* k4* 5C##"%)&k4'*(:4@*A; ;@&k4' :5* :5* :<k;B2; * :2);%4:)<;*7* H" = ; ;<;%0*)(;% ; = :5* 5C' ; ;5)k<;* ;<k@;49;*)(:)*)CB;* A; ;@&k4' * @;5*4")& * ? #%"<;* 5C%<k<:2* " " (; :2)(" " C)9" ? ;5* k4* k4@<k@C:25* =k)(* @; ? ;4)k:7* I)C@&\$*2k ? k):)k"450*% ;9" ? ? ;4@:)k"45*A" % AC)C%;* @&k%;9)k"4*:4@*9&k&4:2*k ? #2&9:)k"45* = ; ;% ;@&59C55; @7!

*

Introduction

J ; ? ;4)k: *k5* :#% " % ;55k<;*4;C%"2" 'k9:2*5\$4@% " ? ;*)(:)* 9:4* 2; :@*)" " AC49)k"4:2* :4@* 9" '4k)k<;* @;9&2k4;* KI : ? #5"40* ! :4@*\$ L * M"4;50* , -- /N7* 8 (; * #%;<:2;49; * % :);5* "A" @ ; ? ;4)k:0* 'k<;4*)(; : 'k4' * # " #C2:)k"40* = k22* k49% : :5 ; * = "%2@=k@; *)" O.7 * ? k22k"4* # ; "#2; * B\$* , -P- KI : ? #5"4* ;) * :270* , -- /N7* Q " " " " A " " @ " k4:3 ; * :4@* ? :24C)%)k"4*k5*9" ? ? "4*k4*k4@<k@C:25* =k)(* @; ? ;4)k: :4@* ? : \$ "99C%* k4*)(; : %2\$* 5): ' ;5* "A*)(; * @&k5; :5; * KI : ? #5"4* ;) * :270* , -- /N7* R4*)(; * 2:);% 5): ' ;5* "A*)(; * @&k5; :5; 0* OST " " A* k4@<k@C:25* =k)(* : @<:49; @* @ ; ? ;4)k: 5CAA; % A" ? * A; ;@&k4' * @&AA&9C2)k;5* :4@* U / T " " A* k4@<k@C:25* @k; * =k)(k4* S ? "4)(5* KH:45"40* V%5;30* W&k22k: ? * L * ! ; % ;\$0* , - . N7* X ; ;@&k4' * @&AA&9C2)k;5*9"45k5)* "A" A: k2C%; *)" % ;9" '4kF; * A " " @0* 2"55* "A" : ##;)k);0* @5\$#(: 'k:0* :4@* :5#%k:)k"4* KI : ? #5"4* ;) * :270* , -- /N7* J C; *) *) * ;5; *4; ' :)k<;*A:9)%"5*4@*)(; * (k' (#%;<:2;49; * "A" A; ;@&k4' * # " #B2; ? 5* k4*)(; * 2:);% 5): ' ;5* "A" @ ; ? ;4)k:0*)CB;* A; ;@&k4' * k5* : * =k@;2\$* C5; @* #%;9)k9; * KI : ? #5"4* ;) * :270* , -- /N7* H" = ; ;<;%0*)(;% ; % ;5;<;% 2%&k535* :55"9k:);@* =k)(*)CB;* A; ;@&k4' 0* 5C9(* :5* k49% : :5; @* k49k@;49; * "A" #%;55C%; * C29; %50*)(; * :99k@;4):2* % ; ? "<:2* @C%k4' * : 'k):)k"4* " " 9"4AC5&k"40*)(; * 4; ;@* A" % % ;5)k: k4)50* k ? ? "B&k&S)0* @k: % (: :0* :4@* A;9:2* k49"4)k4;49; * K J &B: %)"2"0* , -- SN7* R4* : @&k)k"40*)(; * k5*2k)2; * ; ? #k&k9:2* ;<k@;49; *) " " 5C##"%) *) (; * 9C% ;4) * #%;9)k9; * =k)(* 4" " k4@&9:)k"4* "A" k ? #%"<; ? ;4)5*k4* ? : V" % (; :2)(" " C)9" ? ;5* KW: % " = * ;) * :270* , -- Z[* I : ? #5"4* ;) * :270* , -- /N7* I " ? ; 5)C@&k;5* % ; # " %) *) (: * ;4);% 2* A; ;@&k4' * ? : \$0* k4* A:9)0* k49% : :5 ; * ? " ")k&k&S)0* ? " " B&k&S)0* :4@* % ; @C9; * \ C:2k) \$ " " A* 2kA; * KI : ? #5"4* ;) * :270* , -- /N7* ! 8 (; * @ ;9k5k"4*) " " : %)&k&9k:22\$* A; ;@* k4@<k@C:25* =k)(* @ ; ? ;4)k: * k5* (k' (2\$*9"4)%"<;%5k:20*% :k5k4' * ? :4\$*A&59:20*);(k9:2* :4@* ? " " :2*9"49; %45* K J C30* ! (:40* HC&k L * 85;0* , - . Z[* ^ k)9(;220* _C9(:4:40*]k)2; (:2:0* L * H: ? ;20* , -- P[* I : ? #5"4* ;) * :270* , -- /N7* D2);%4:)<;*2\$0* (:4@* A; ;@&k4' * k5* : * % ; (C ? :4; * : # " % :9(* :4@*9:4* :22;<k:);*

(C4' ;%0*)(k5)* :4@* k ? #%"<;* \ C:2k) \$ " " A* 2kA; * :4@* 5"9k:2&F: k"4*k4*k4@<k@C:25* =k)(* @; ? ;4)k: * K J k _ : %)"2"0* , -- S[* W: % " = * ;) * :270* , -- ZN7* ! C% ;4)2\$0* (k' (* \ C:2k) \$ 5)C@&k;5*9" ? #: %k4' * " % :2* :4@*)CB;* A; ;@&k4' * % ; * 2k ? k);@0* (" = ;<;%0*)(; * k5* 5" ? ; * ;<k@;49; *) " " 5C##"%) *) (:4@* A; ;@&k4' * :5* : * <k;B2; * " #)k"4* = " ") (\$ " " A AC) (; % k4<;5)k' :)k"4*kH:45"4* ;) * :270* , - . N7!

Objectives

8 (; * #k ? : % \$ " BY;9)k<;* "A*)(k5* #; % k5*)" 9%&k)k9:22\$* ;<:2C:);(; ;>k5)k4' * 2k);%)C%; " " 4* (:4@*A; ;@&k4' :5* :4* ;AA;9)<;* :4@*A; :5&B2; * :2);%4:)<;*)")CB;* A; ;@&k4' * k4* k4@<k@C:25* =k)(* @; ? ;4)k:7* 8 (; * 9"4@: % \$ " BY;9)k<;* k5*) " " ;>: ? k4; * :4* :2);%4:)<;*)")CB;* A; ;@&k4' *) (:)* 9:4* (;2#* @&k;9) * 9" ? #:55k"4:); * :4@* ;<k@;49;E&k4A" % ? ;@ 9: % ;) " " k4@<k@C:25* =k)(* @; ? ;4)k:7*

Methods

Search Strategy

G42k4; * @:):B:5;50* 5#;9&k&9:22\$* QCB ^ ;@0* ! R6DH]0* :4@*W" " '2; * I9("2: %0* = ; % ; * C5; @*)" * 5; : %9("A" % ;)k92;5* % ;2:);@*)" *) (; *) #k9" "A" k4);% 5)7* 8 (; * A"22" = k4' *) ; ? 5* = ; % ;5: %9(; @* aKD2);%4:)<;N* D6 J * K)CB;* A; ;@&k4' N* Gb * K;4);% 2*)CB;* A; ;@&k4' N* D6 J * K(:4@*A; ;@&k4' N* Gb * K" :2* A; ;@&k4' N* D6 J * K@; ? ;4)k:Nc7*

Selection Criteria

492C@;@*)="* 4"4E%:4@" ? &F;@* 9" ("%)* 5)C@&;5* K2;<;2*
,B*;<@;49;N0*)="*5\$5); ? :)&9*%;<@;=5*"A*)(;*2&);%)C%;*
K2;<;2* ,*;<@;49;N0*:4@*)="*&4A"% ? :)&"4:2*%;<@;=5*"A*
(;*2&);%)C%;*K2;<;2*d*;<@;49;N7**

Results

6"4Eb:4@" ? &F;@* ! ("%)*I)C@&;5*

!

6"4E%:4@" ? &F;@* 9" ("%)*5)C@&;5* :%;*##%"#%&:);*=(;4*
A:9)"%5*9:44")*B;,%:4@" ? &F;@*:5*@; ? "45):);@*&4*)(;*
:)%&92;5* %;<@;=@7* 8(;%;A"%;0*)(;* @:):* 5("C2@* B;*
&4);%#%;);@* =&)(*9:C)&"4* ' &<;4*)(;*)C@&;5* :%;*
5CBY;9)*""B5;%;<)&"4:2*B&:5;5*=(;4*)(;*5)C@&\$*@;5& '4*
@";5*4")*&492C@;:*eB2&4@f*#"9;@C%;7**

!

!"#\$%&'()*+*,*#)'*(- .%&*/'(0 ! 1#2&(345678(
:4@*)CB;*A; ;@&4 ' * K4gU.N* &4* "C)9" ? ; * ? : 5C%;5%;2:);@*
)" * 5C%&<@:2* %);50* :5#&:)&"4* #4;C ? "4&:0* :4@* ("5#&):2*
:@ &55&"457R4*:*4"4E%:4@" ? &F;@0*#"5#;9)&<;0*9" ("%)*
5)C@&\$*@;5& '40* "C)9" ? ; * ? : 5C%;5* = ; % ; * 9"22;9);@* :)*UE*
:4@* SE ? "4)(5* # "5)E ("5#&):2&F:)&"47* Q%"9;@C%;5*
&492C@;@*);2;#("4;* &4);&<@;=5* =&)(* : * 9; % ; ' &<;%* B\$*
"4;* "A*)(;* :C) ("5%:4@*92&4&9:2*;<;2C:)&"45*9"45&5)&4 '*
"A* : * B;@5&@; * 5=:22"= &4 '* ;>; ? &4:)&"40* ? ; :5C%; ? ;4)*
"A* 9:2A* 9&9C ? A; % ; 49;0* :4@* : * #%;55C%; * C29; % 5); :&4 '*
5\$5); ? 7* 8 (; * % ; 5C2)5* &4@&9:);@* (& (; % * &49&@;49;5* "A*
:5#&:)&"4* #4;C ? "4&:0* #%;55C%; * C29; % 50* :4@* ? "%):2&)\$*
&4*)(* ;)CB;* A; ;@&4 '* ' %"C#* =&)(* 4"* 5& '4&A&9:4)*
&&AA; % ; 49;5*A"C4@* &4* ("5#&):2* :@ ? &55&"457*

!

I);4')(5* &492C@;@* :4* :##%"#%&:);* % ;5; :%9(* @;5& '40*
? ;)("@50*:4@* =;22*5#;9&&@;@*#:%)&9&#;4)5;2;9)&"47*8 (; *
@:):* =:5* :4:2\$F;@* =&)(* :##%"#%&:);* 5):&5)&9:2*
? ; :5C%;5*)(;)* = ; % ; <@;49;EB:5;@* :4@* 9" ? # : % :B2;*
)" * #%;&<@;"C5* % ;5; :%9(*5)C@&;57*Q");4)&:2* 5;2;9)&"4* B&:5*

k4@k<k@C:250* =k)(* 4" * 5k'4kA(9:4)* @kAA;% ;49;5* k4*
#%;55C%;*C29;%5*B;)= ; ;4*)(; '% "C#5*:4@*4" *5k'4kA(9:4)*
k ? #%"< ; ? ;4)5*k4*5C%<k<:2*A"22"=k4'*)(; *k45;%)k"4* "A* : *
A ; ;@k4' *)CB;7* 1 ; k' () * ' :k4* :4@* 4C)%k"4* (:@* ? k> ;@*
% ;5C2)50* (" = ; < ; %0* "4 ; *5)C@S%#%#%) ; @*k49% ; :5 ; @* = ; k' () *
' :k4* "A"22"=k4'*)(; *k45;%)k"4* "A* A ; ; @k4' *)CB;57* 8 (k5*
; # ; %* 5C##"%) ; @* #% ; < k" C5* A k4@k4' 5*) (: * k4@k9 :) ; * 4" *
92k4k9:2* k ? #%"< ; ? ;4)5* =k)(*) (; * C5 ; * "A*)CB ; * A ; ; @k4' 0*
(" = ; < ; %0* k)k5* : *9" ? ? "42\$*C5 ; @*#% : 9)k9 ; 7*

!

R492C5k"4* : 4@* ; >92C5k"4*9%k) ; %k : * = ; % ; *92 ; : %2\$* @ ; A k4 ; @*
:4@* : * 5" C4@* 5 ; : %9(* 5)%) ; ' \$ * = : 5* k ? #2 ; ? ; 4) ; @* k4*
"% ; %*)" * ' :) (; %* : ##% " #%k :) ; * %)k92 ; 5*)" * % ; < k ; = 7* 8 (; *
? ;) (" "2" ' \$* C5 ; @* = : 5* : ##% " #%k :) ; * B : 5 ; @* "4*) (; *
5)C@S% @ ; 5k' 47* GA*) (; * . - * 5)C@k ; 5* k492C@ ; @0* "42\$* "4 ; *
= : 5* % : 4@" ? kF ; @* : 4@* ? : 4\$* "A*) (; * 5)C@k ; 5* (: @* 2" = *
2 ; < ; 25* "A* ; < k @ ; 49 ; 7* R4* : @ @ k)k"40* : ' ; * "A* # ; %)k9k# : 4)50*
5 ;)k4' 0* : 4@* 5) ; ' ; * "A* @ ; ? ; 4)k : * @k : '4"5k5* = ; % ; * 4") *
92 ; : %2\$* @ ; A k4 ; @7* D* 2k ? k) ; @* 4C ? B ; %* "A* 5)C@k ; 5* ? ;) *
9%k) ; %k : * A "%*) (k5* % ; < k ; = 0* @ ; ? "45%) : k4' *) (; * 2:93* "A*
< k @ ; 49 ; EB : 5 ; @* % ; 5 ; : %9(* ; > : ? k4k4' *92k4k9:2* "C)9" ? ; 5*
k4'A ; ; @k4' * : 2) ; %4 :)k< ; 5*A " %k4@k<k@C:25* =k)(* @ ; ? ; 4)k : 7*

!

8 (k5* 5)C@S% #%"<k@ ; 5* 5C' ' ; 5)k< ; * ; < k @ ; 49 ; *) (: *)CB ; *
A ; ; @k4' * ? : \$* 4") * #%"2"4' * 2kA ; 0* % ; @C9 ; * % :) ; 5* "A*
:5#k% : k"40* #% ; 55C% ; * C29 ; %50* "%* k ? #%"< ; * 4C)%k)k"4:2*
"C)9" ? ; 57**

!

? &# / . #(*\$(&;(345668(9"4@C9) ; @* : *5\$5) ; ? :)k9*% ; < k ; = *
"A* , d* 92k4k9:2*)%k : 250* k492C@k4' * . 0* % : 4@" ? kF ; @*
9"4)%"22 ; @* 5)C@k ; 50* k4< ; 5)k' :)k4' * k ? #%"< ; ? ; 4) * k4*
92k4k9:2* "C)9" ? ; * =k)(* "% : 2* A ; ; @k4' * k4) ; %< ; 4)k"45* k4*
k4@k<k@C:25* =k)(* @ ; ? ; 4)k : 7*D*QR ! G8*A% : ? ; = "%3* = : 5*
C5 ; @* @ ; A k4 ; * # : %)k9k# : 4) * ; 2k' k B k2k) \$7* 8 (; *
? ;) (" "2" ' k9:2* 9 (: % : 9) ; %k5)k95* "A* ; ; 9(* 5)C@S% = ; % ; *
:55k'4 ; @* \C:2k) \$* : 4@* Bk : 5* % :)k4' 57* G% : 2* A ; ; @k4' *
k4) ; %< ; 4)k"45* k492C@ ; @* (k' (* 9:2" %k ; * 5C##2 ; ? ; 4)50*
:## ; k) ; * 5)k' C2:4)50* :55k5) ; @* A ; ; @k4' * :4@* ? " @kA k ; @*
@k ;)57* ! 2k4k9:2* "C)9" ? ; 5* ? ; : 5C% ; @* = ; % ; * 5C%<k<:20*
AC49)k"40* :4@* = ; k' () * ' :k47* 8 (; * 5)C@k ; 5* #%"<k@ ; @*
? " @ ; % :) ; * 5) % ; 4') (* ; < k @ ; 49 ; * A "%* (k' (* 9:2" %k ; *
5C##2 ; ? ; 4)5* :4@* 2" = * 5) % ; 4') (* ; < k @ ; 49 ; * A "%* "% : 2*
A ; ; @k4' * k4) ; %< ; 4)k"45*)" * #%" ? ") ; * = ; k' () * ' :k47* 6" * *
A ; ;) ; *A(5) # ;) * @*

:C)("5%;?#(:5&F;@*)(;*k?#"%):49;*A@<:49;@*9:%;*
#2:44&k4'?:4@*:@<:49;@*@k%;9)k<;5*)"*k?#"<:*@;9k5k"4*
?:3&k4'%;':%&k4'"#)k?:2*A;;@&k4'9:%;*:5*@;?;4)k:*
#"'%;55;57*_:5;@*"4*)(;*H"5#k):2*DC("k)S\$
'C&@;2&k4;5*"4%);:)?;4)*A"%*)(;*)?&k4:22S*k220*]C3*);*

DiBartolo, M. C. (2006). Careful hand feeding: A reasonable alternative to PEG tube placement in individuals with dementia. *Journal of Gerontological Nursing*, 32(5), 25-33. Retrieved from <https://www-lib-uwo-ca.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/cgi-bin/ezpauthn.cgi?url=http://search.proquest.com.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/docview/204201343?accountid=15115>

Garrow, D., Pride, P., Moran, W., Zapka, J., Amella, E., & Delege, M. (2007). Feeding alternatives in patients with dementia: Examining the evidence. *Clinical Gastroenterology and Hepatology*, 5(12), 1372-