

Critical Review:
In patients with total laryngectomy, is gender related to quality of life outcomes?

Sarah McSheffrey
M.Cl.Sc SLP Candidate
University of Western Ontario: School of Communication Sciences and Disorders

Total laryngectomy is a procedure

The objective of this paper is to critically review the literature in order to discover whether voice handicap and overall QOL outcomes are influenced by gender for individuals who have undergone TL.

Search Strategy

Computerized databases including PubMed, PsycInfo, and CINAHL, as well as Google Scholar, were used to find journal articles. The following search terms were used: (laryngectomy) OR (alaryngeal speech) AND (gender) OR

pilot study before distribution. This helped ensure acceptable validity of the questions.

One caution warranted for this study is the paucity of statistical analysis performed with the questionnaire data. While the article mentions an analysis of correlations, there is no information provided on the type of analysis performed or the results of this analysis. The results section indicated differences between the male and female groups; however, the lack of statistical data prevents the reader from determining whether these differences are of statistical significance.

Overall, this study identifies several potential differences between male and female laryngectomees that may have implications for each group's unique rehabilitation needs. The researchers provide suggestive evidence that females have more physical complaints, less satisfaction with post-operative information provided, and have different preferred methods of support following TL. They also provide evidence that there are similarities between the two groups. It should be noted that indicators employed in this study were arguably related to QOL (e.g., physician satisfaction) but may not be direct measures of psychological and social well-being. Given this, and also due to the lack of statistical analysis reported on this data, the results should be interpreted with caution.

Moukarbel et al. (2010) used retrospective data to examine the voice handicap in TL patients for each of the three alaryngeal speech methods. They used a mixed between-groups design to compare these three groups, as well as the influence of gender within and between groups. Results reported no significant differences between the male and female populations.

This study had 75 participants, 51 men and 24 women. The participants had previously completed a QOL questionnaire, which measured the degree of vocal handicap experienced by the patient and has had its validity and reliability proven in numerous prior studies, including studies of alaryngeal speech outcomes (Kazi et al., 2005). However, this questionnaire is limited to voice-

unsuccessful reintegration into society following surgery. This difficulty is perpetuated by changes associated with physical disfigurement, voice quality, and psychological functioning. Additional factors such

Fung, K., & Terrell, J.E. (2004). Outcomes research in head and neck cancer. *Otorhinolaryngology*